



2015

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, May 28, 2015,
4th Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701

1. Call to Order / Roll Call:

Meeting called to session at 1:05 PM

Commissioners: Patsy Waterfall (Acting Chair), Arthur Stables, Sharon Chadwick, Jim Sauer

Staff: Michael Taku, Alexandra Hines (PDSD), Jonathan Mabry (CHPO), Greg Jackson (Economic Initiatives Office)

2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 4-23-15

Motion by Commissioner Stables to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 4-23-15. Motion seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

- a. HPZ-15-17** - Bernal Properties LLC - Detached Steel Carport - 517 South Main Avenue (Barrio Historico)

At the request of the applicant through staff, case is continued to future date.

- b. HPZ-15-34** - Neff - New Garage/Guesthouse - 741 South 4th Avenue (Armory Park)

Applicant Kirsten Neff presented the proposal.

Staff Taku read the motion from the Armory Park Historic Advisory Board (APHZAB) Legal Action Report into the record. Board requested wood double hung windows before approving the proposal.

Motion by Commissioner Chadwick to recommend approval of proposal as presented with qualification that all proposed windows be wood double hung. Seconded by Commissioner Stables.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

c. HPZ-15-37 - Roth - Replacement Windows/Paint/Mechanical - 1031 North 3rd Avenue (West University) [Zoning Violation]

Applicants Howard and Mary Roth presented the case for the windows and windows behind the property was inspected and approved when they got permits for a fence.

Staff Taku let the applicant know that the plans review conducted in 2009 was for the proposed fence and windows were not reviewed at that time.

Staff Mabry referenced the Technical Standards Manual in that window replacements are “like for like”, i.e. same material.

Staff Taku read the motion from the West University Historic Advisory Board (WUHZAB) Legal Action Report into the record.

Applicant Roth suggested covering up windows with wood screens. Staff Mabry explained that zoning violations run with the land. This option did not appear acceptable to commissioners.

Commissioner Chadwick said that wood screens are not sufficient and that with just a quorum, the commissioners have to be unanimous in their recommendation.

Motion by Commissioner Stables to continue the case so that the applicant may collect more competitive quotes on wood windows and the applicant can present to a larger body of commissioners. Seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

d. HPZ-15-38 - Toth - Cat/Garden House Addition - 416 East 16th Street (Armory Park)

Applicant Cheryl Toth presented the proposal.

Staff Taku read the motion from the Armory Park Historic Advisory Board (APHZAB) Legal Action Report into the record.

Motion by Commissioner Chadwick to recommend approval of proposal as presented with qualification to waive the building setbacks of the proposed addition. Seconded by Commissioner Stables.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

- e. **HPZ-15-39** - Kelley - Porch Addition/Detached Structure - 825 South 2nd Avenue (Armory Park)

Applicant Andrew Hesse presented the proposal for the property owner.

Staff Taku read the motion from the Armory Park Historic Advisory Board (APHZAB) Legal Action Report into the record.

Commissioner Chadwick noted that any work done before the district was established is grandfathered in until work is done on that structure.

Motion by Commissioner Sauer to recommend approval of proposal as presented with qualification to waive the building setbacks of the proposed structure. Seconded by Commissioner Stables.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

4. **Current Issues for Information/Discussion:**

- a. Minor Reviews

Staff updated Subcommittee on minor reviews during the last month and acknowledged on behalf of PDSD, the great volunteer time of all the commissioners in making these reviews to be carried out.

- b. Appeals

Nothing at this time.

- c. Zoning Violations

Staff continues to assist on abatement of violations in the historic districts. Staff noted that there are many window violations that will be coming to the subcommittee for review and action.

5. **Call to the Audience**

Staff Greg Jackson, on behalf of Elaine Becherer from the City Manager's Office, gave an informational presentation of the Eckbo Plaza and Landscape Challenges to the Commissioners. A handout was provided.

6. **Future Items**

Staff Mabry noted that the commissioners might have an opportunity to revisit and discuss the standards and guidelines related to window material. Commissioner Chadwick explained that the commissioners ultimately maintained the standards and guidelines for window material when it was revisited years ago. Commissioner Stables said there are continuing to be more materials made available for windows. Staff Mabry noted that a handout of “best practices” could aid in a unified and consistent recommendation to window violations. Commissioner Sauer requested for the discussion regarding window material be put on the agenda for next meeting as an action item if necessary.

7. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:20 p.m.